Part One: What is PIJ?
Our Promises to the Public Insight Network

1. We won’t publish, broadcast or distribute your responses without your explicit permission.
   - Unless the source has given you permission to publish within their response, this means emailing (OK) or calling (better) the person. We do this for two reasons:
     - We want people to be comfortable telling us inside information without the fear that we will immediately publish it or attribute it to them.
     - We want to minimize the chance that someone is using a fake identity or scamming us. We want to know there is a real person behind the response.

2. If you give us permission to publish your comments, we may edit them before putting them on air or on the web. Also, we aren’t required to use them and we have the right to reuse or republish them later.

3. Your personal information and responses will only be seen by PIJ partner newsrooms, APM editorial staff, and contractors who perform technology related tasks, research or database work for or on behalf of APM systems. If APM does so, those contractors or researchers will be required to sign a confidentiality agreement.

4. We will not use your information for marketing, membership or promotional purposes. The journalism-business firewall means that as a source in the Public Insight Network you will receive:
   - No spam messages;
   - No invitations to participate in fundraising or membership activities;
   - No invitations to participate in promotional events; and
   - When we talk about the Network with our colleagues, your personal information is kept confidential.

5. APM and its newsroom partners work together to ensure that you receive, on average, one query a month from the Public Insight Network, unless you specifically agree to more regular contact.
Putting PIJ to work for your newsroom

How does PIJ work?

Here is a typical example of how PIJ might work for a 1-4 day turnaround story.

STEP 1: The Conversation

In most cases, PIJ starts with a conversation between a reporter, editor or a producer and a PIJ analyst—during a meeting, a chat in the hallway or a phone call. The journalist may be checking out a hunch or a story idea, starting research on an assigned story or show and interested in getting information to define an angle or guide the reporting, or working on a story and looking for sources with experience.

The analyst will ask for information about the story idea, or the general direction of reporting. Typical questions include: What question are you answering in the story? What reporting have you already done? Who would you ideally like to speak with? Can we think about this more broadly and be open to other angles, or have you already focused your idea? What is your deadline?

STEP 2: The query

The analyst takes the information the journalist provides and uses it to write an Email with a link to a brief survey, together known as a “query.” The analyst matches the tone and language of the query to the newsroom or show’s style. The Email can be short and to the point, or it can provide deeper info an context.

The survey features a mix of structured and unstructured questions. The first questions are designed to help us learn more about that person’s particular background and experience. Here we may ask for information about what relationship they have to the topic at hand.

Next we ask open-ended questions designed to elicit more in-depth, narrative responses. We look for knowledge, not opinions. Typically, we ask: How does [THIS TOPIC] affect you personally? Or: What is your experience with this issue?

Then, we ask an open-ended question that gives people an open door to tell us the things they want to tell us (i.e., What else should we know?)

We typically close the survey with a few demographic questions that are relevant to the topic that we may not already know about a source, such as age, occupation, income, etc.

The analyst works with an editor to finalize the query.

STEP 3: Sending to the Network

We solicit insight from the Network in a couple of ways: (1) By targeting the query to people who we think may have relevant expertise or unusual perspectives; or (2) by sending it to a random group of people in the network. Often, we will use a mix of these approaches to ensure a range of responses. Our aim is to increase the chance that we will be surprised by the responses. We’ll also publish the query to the newsroom’s website and to social media.

Many people in our Network have shared information that gives us a sense of their expertise and their experience. In some cases, they have told us their occupation, where they work, when they were born, how many kids they have, etc. Quite often, they also share information with us in their response such as: “As an elementary school teacher, I know quite a bit about children with autism and how they’re affected by school budget cuts…” This information gives us keywords we can use to search for and
Public Insight Journalism training manual
Part One: What is PIJ?

pull together a group of people with a wide variety of experience and expertise related to the topic at hand.

STEP 4: The response

Responses start arriving within minutes. The bulk of the responses appear within 24 hours, though more trickle in as people forward the query to friends and family, or as people check seldom-used Email accounts.

The public insight analysts read every response that comes in. They immediately flag those that are compelling, grabbing sources, quotes and anecdotes from each and saving them in a document that they will refine and pass on to the reporter/editor/producer for follow-up.

How the analyst delivers information depends on the journalist’s’ deadlines and preferences, and the number and nature of the responses: It can be as simple as forwarding Emails or as formal as a report including pitches, themes, leads, selected quotes and a source list.

STEP 5: The thank you note

Within two weeks, the analyst will send a short note to everyone who responded to thank them and tell them when/where they can listen/view/read/experience the piece(s), and letting them know that their insight informed reporting.

This step is critical to maintaining a strong relationship with people in our Network (sources are delighted when they get a thank you note!). Otherwise, public sources feel they are writing into a black hole. The reporter’s part to play here is to let the analyst know how they used the responses.

STEP 6: Developing sources over time

Everything we learn from our public sources is stored in a database called the Audience Insight Repository (AIR). AIR allows us to learn from and about people over time. The schoolteacher who told us about having to pay for textbooks herself may also know a fair bit about green building; the executive may also be able to tell us about the declining quality of fishing streams; the entrepreneur starting a new business may have told us two years ago about getting laid off from a company that is cutting jobs again.

What kinds of stories are best suited to PIJ?

Stories that would benefit from the insights, perspectives, ideas and tips of people with firsthand knowledge and experience. Stories where you don’t want to go to the same sources you have used before. Sound like many of the stories you work on? We hope so.

We encourage you to open up to insights from the Network as often as possible, and see what comes back. In the best case, you can find a story or angle or compelling source you didn’t know about. In the worst case, either (a) we get no response or (b) what we do get back is uninteresting. In either case, we’ve still reached out to people in our Network, and they will appreciate it. We’ll bring to your attention everything that comes in, or only the best of it—depending on how much time you want to spend vetting and distilling. Some reporters love to see it all; some only want the one or two scintillating sources that emerge. You choose.

There are a few types of stories where PIJ has been very effective.

The hunch

Got a sneaking suspicion that something’s changing? Do you feel it in your gut, but lack the data to back it up? Do you have some dots that you’d like help connecting? Ask the people in the Public Insight Network. Combining journalists’ informed instincts with the knowledge and expertise of the Public Insight Network can yield compelling results.
On-the-ground impacts

You’re covering a story that has far-reaching effects, and you’re not sure what angle is best—or how to cover the breadth of the story’s reach. A perfect PIJ opportunity.

We can call out to the Network asking for peoples’ experience. By targeting the query to diverse groups, and ensuring a mix of recipients, we can show how people in various strata and positions are experiencing the issue at hand. Maps and other visual ways to convey insight can be compelling treatments.

The fresh angle

You’re tracking a story that other news outlets are following, but you’re looking for the angle that makes it fresh, relevant and distinctive. By reaching out to people in the Network, we very often turn up fascinating angles and ideas for other, related stories.

What sorts of stories don’t work so well with PIJ?

PIJ doesn’t work for every story. There are at least two general types of stories where the traditional reporting process works best.

Stories of officialdom

Many stories start and end in corridors of power. PIJ has some reach into these realms—with politicians, CEOs and others. It may be worth calling out to people in our Network to see what comes back. But generally, shoe leather and phone calls to the obvious sources are the way to go.

Needles in the haystack

PIJ is often perceived as an efficient way to find specific sources, say male teens who come from divorced families and are addicted to alcohol. It’s worth looking for these sources by searching the database. But we tend to avoid querying for them, because:

(1) People in the Network sign up to share what they know. If they receive a query looking for a very specific sort of person, probability suggests to them that it’s unlikely we’ll ever want them to share their experience—as a result, they unsubscribe or ignore future queries.

(2) The real benefit of PIJ is to help us learn from people who have in-person knowledge and experience. If we’ve already done 98% of the reporting and are just looking for a “real person” to plug into the story, how much learning are we doing? Not much. People can sniff out these kinds of questions.

Even if we can’t find the right person, we can talk to you about what your goals are for your story (in this case, perhaps, exploring the effects of war on the psyche), and if you’re open to it, ask a broader question of the Network and see what we get back. You may find that the soldier with PTSD isn’t the only person who can tell this story well. What about the wives of soldiers, their kids, psychologists, pastors, etc? We can help broaden the story, and find people with unexpectedly relevant insights.

Of course, there are times when broadening the question and reaching out to the Network just isn’t possible (tight deadlines, editorial demands, etc.) But if you have some lead time, and are willing to consider other interesting angles, ask away.
When should I use PIJ?

The earlier, the better. Analysts are here to help you be the best reporter you can be, and tell stories faster and more insightfully than the competition: to create distinctive journalism. Use your analyst to test out your ideas early to get the most out of the Network.

Does using PIJ mean extra work for me?

PIJ can (sometimes dramatically) accelerate the reporting process. With PIJ, you might turn up several sources with relevant expertise within a day or two, where it might have taken you days or weeks to find these people without PIJ.

That said, here’s what you need to do:

1. Find and share information to help the analyst frame the question (stats, reports, etc.)
2. Talk to an analyst about your goals for the story, and help come up with the questions that will engage people and yield relevant information for your reporting.
3. Read the responses. If you love flipping through sheaves of paper to find a gem, we’ll be happy to forward you every response that comes in. Often, it won’t be more than a dozen. But sometimes, our questions can bring in hundreds of responses. You can read them all… or you can let us distill the highlights for you.
4. Contact and interview respondents. PIJ respondents aren’t your typical news sources. They won’t all be ready with 20-second sound bites the moment you call them. It may take some patience and persistence to get PIJ sources on the record. You can also ask analysts to do preinterviews.
5. Respond to an analyst’s query response summaries promptly. After digesting responses to your query, often an analyst will have ideas for additional stories. But if a query is pegged to your reporting, you’ve got dibs. Let the analyst know which ideas or sources you’re pursuing so the analyst can develop other elements, pitch them to other shows, etc., while the ideas and sources are fresh.
6. Let the analyst know who you called, what resulted, and if there’s any new info on sources. This helps keep the database up-to-date, and guard against double-dipping.

How else can PIJ be involved in the newsroom?

Tips, story ideas and leads

Tap your friendly PIJ analyst on the shoulder and ask what they’ve got cooking. We always have ideas and sources that have yet to find a home; and leads that are unrefined but promising. Analysts are always open to checking our database and seeing if we can find people who have interesting and relevant experiences. It just takes a minute. Treat the analyst as a partner and a fellow brainstormer.

Also, the analyst regularly asks our public sources to tell the newsroom what they think we should be covering. That can be a great source of story leads.

Engaging sources online

APM’s PIJ team at times creates news games and interactive experiences to engage the audience around various issues, draw out their knowledge, and bring them into the Network. If you have an idea, let us know.
Roundtables and tracking groups

We can organize groups of people that you can check in with from time to time. For instance, we can create a group of centrist voters to track throughout the election season. Or we can create a group of weather observers to provide on-the-ground details to flesh out the storm maps.

Commentaries

Analysts can help find the unusual voices and perspectives that illustrate diverse views on breaking news. For example, PIJ might find young Muslim voices to share their views on airport profiling.

Creating content

We can produce additional content for broadcast, print and the web, including first-person stories, commentaries, slideshows, blogs, etc.

Insight sessions

We can hold in-person “insight sessions” where we ask people about the important issues in their lives and their work or explore a specific topic, like immigration. Reporters and editors attend the meetings and meet new sources, and analysts circulate notes from the meetings to all involved.

Or analysts can gather people with firsthand knowledge of an issue like K-12 education (parents, teachers, principals, students, counselors, youth workers, pastors, etc.) to talk about what they see as the most important issues for news coverage. This can help beat reporters develop their coverage agendas.

It’s up to you

Remember that PIJ is a way of approaching journalism. It’s about tapping the wisdom of the communities we serve. That does at least three things for us. First, it brings more diverse voices, perspectives and knowledge to our coverage. Second, it helps us find hidden or emerging stories and trends. And third, it helps us find out what issues and angles really matter to the audience, so we can make our coverage more relevant and set a distinctive coverage agenda.

That means we can try anything that you think may help us find new sources, stories or knowledge. So feel free to suggest some wild ideas to an analyst.
Newsroom testimonials: MPR, APM and PIJ Partners

“I've found the experience of working with our PIN analyst to be wonderfully collaborative and creative. This year I produced a series on our state's mental health system, and nearly all the pieces were informed by sources found by our PIN analyst. And in some cases, new stories emerged that I hadn't thought of including originally but that ended up being integral to the series.”

-- Allison Frost, Managing Editor, Oregon Public Broadcasting News (2008)

“We’re pleased to be a Public Insight Journalism partner station. We began the program in January of 2009 and our network continues to grow, approaching 1500 members. We’ve broken several stories since we launched our network. Some of the stories have had more hard-news value than others, but all have been original news stories. We have also been amazed at how honest and open people are in responses to queries. These are people we have never met, yet they feel enough of a connection and trust with KUOW to open up to us about personal issues, including finances and health. Finally, we have been able to establish working partnerships with reporters and our talk shows. We have found that the PIN is flexible enough to satisfy both long-term reporting and the need for sources for a talk show going on the air the next day.”

-- Arvid Hokanson, Assistant Program Director, KUOW (2010)

“The PIN has become an ever increasing and valuable tool for us on “The Exchange” on New Hampshire Public Radio. We’ve used it in several ways:

- We’ve been able to develop roundtables that have included listener guests...

- We’ve used people’s insight to formulate multi-show series... Two of recent note that we used PIJ for were on NH’s drinking water and one on the ramifications -- good and bad -- of New Hampshire’s aging population. In both of these we asked the PIN what they knew on the topic, what they’d want to hear discussed and their experiences. We had an idea for installments but the answers really helped to form better ideas. [We] used a few [PIN sources] as guests, callouts or part of our produced pieces but I found using their ideas to shape the series to be the most instrumental.

- We’ve been producing a philosophy series called “The Socrates Exchange” where we discuss one question for the hour using the Socratic Method of Inquiry (for example “Should Race Matter” or “what is the relationship between Money, Happiness and a Good Life”). Being that this is a completely caller-driven show, we feel the need to “plant” a few calls in the beginning of this show. We send out a PIN-query and use a few of the best answers as these plants… this helps start the show in the correct way and inform the listeners as to the calls we’re looking for in this show.”

-- Keith Shields, Executive Producer of The Exchange, NHPR (2008)

“Reporters and producers on the interview program Colorado Matters are suggesting PIN queries as much or more than our PIN analyst or me. It didn't take long for them to see the merits in it. We had examples of finding sources for a kind of unwieldy story - the anniversary of a light rail line that had high ridership but also complaints, and we got many good responses from people with different experiences; when the Rockies went to the World Series we found unusual fan stories within hours; when we asked listeners to share their stories of "hope and gratitude" we got 70 responses - a woman who reflected on the lessons she learned from her brother's murder, a guy who almost died when his plane crashed into a lake - these are stories you simply couldn't drum up on your own. Most reporters recognize the PIN can be a tool when they want to find direct experiences to illustrate a study or a trend. The other day my health reporter proposed a PIN query to find out what people thought of hospitals that were highly or poorly ranked in a new state online ranking. We talked about aiming to find people with experiences in hospitals with high or low rankings, then realized it made sense to go more general, and perhaps learn something about how people pick a hospital, and whether
the rankings the state put together would really matter to people. As is so often the case, we figured PIN would give us something we knew we needed for a story and also possibly direct us to other story lines that no one had covered yet.”


“Responses to public insight inquiries have served as a useful guide for the documentary producers working on our immigration project, Homeland. While the network has not been used to recruit or identify specific individuals for inclusion in the documentary, the comments, opinions and experiences shared by the respondents have provided a context not available through sources offering more strident and extreme points of view. The public insight inquiries, I believe, are considered by those who receive them to be honest attempts at gaining community input, and the responses indicate a willingness to be open rather than argumentative.”

-- Jim Kirchherr, KETC Producer (2010)

“I have used PIJ to help me find sources for at least half a dozen Marketplace spot and feature stories. These were sources who gave me an on-the-ground, first person perspective on the news of the day, and they were sources I would have never been able to find without PIJ's vast database … Their personal testimonies added a new dimension to my pieces. Their voices gave my pieces three dimensionality and an emotional impact that no analyst could ever match… PIJ sources stand out for their unique, real-world quality. I've been asked by two different editors, How did you find that person? They assumed I knew them personally. When I told them PIJ, they were impressed. That has helped develop my reputation at Marketplace as one of the most eager early adopters of PIJ. PIJ offers a brand new tool to journalists. It allows us to survey a broader array of people than ever before was possible. Sourcing is just the beginning of the power of PIJ, and I look forward to continuing to harness the wisdom of crowds in my future reporting.”

-- Dan Grech, former Americas Desk reporter, Marketplace (2008)

"PIN is [Think Out Loud’s] direct pipeline to people who can speak from experience about the ways in which government policies, cultural attitudes, and the sweeping forces of our times have directly affected their lives. The stories our PIN guests have to tell are often the most compelling we have put on our air... about everything from their experience with abortion to their experience as a juror, from their struggles with racism to their struggles with religious beliefs. PIN has made our programs deeper and truer, and it has challenged us as producers to think about ways we can shift the dialogue away from one that revolves around opinion to one that reflects how experience shapes who we are."

-- Eve Epstein, Managing Editor, OPB News (2008)
Best of the Network: a sampler

These examples of ambitious and creative public insight-informed content are just a sampling of what APM, MPR and PIJ partner newsrooms are doing with the Public Insight Network every day.

Colorado Public Radio (KCFR)

- **Understanding Unaffiliated Voters, part I**
  Colorado has a high number of unaffiliated voters. Insights gleaned from PIN sources led analyst Dan Meyers to wonder if the number was growing. A call to the Secretary of State's office confirmed the hunch, and Meyers explored the phenomenon through the stories of three people who reject the main political parties – a former Republican, a disenchanted Democrat and a first-time voter.

- **Stories of Hope & Gratitude**
  During the 2007 holiday season, KCFR News asked Coloradans to share stories in which a person or event made a huge difference in their lives. Their responses fueled this series of powerful tales of how hope arose from despair, how acts large and small make them grateful.

Marketplace and Marketplace Money (APM)

- **Ghost Town USA**
  Tess Vigeland tours the wasteland of foreclosed homes near Stockton, California, and meets a family that's resorted to squatting in their own home. PIJ querying around mortgage issues located the sources at the center of this story.

- **Who Is the Middle Class?**
  [http://marketplace.publicradio.org/display/web/2008/01/11/who_is_the_middle_class/](http://marketplace.publicradio.org/display/web/2008/01/11/who_is_the_middle_class/)
  Starting to get ahead? Just getting by? Steve Tripoli asks three self-identified middle class families what it means to be a part of the middle. PIJ querying around financial status and class identity developed the story concept and the sources used in the piece.

- **Ground Truth: The Business of War**
  As the head of the private security firm Blackwater explained his company's role in the killings of Iraqi civilians to Congress in October 2007, Marketplace aired and published online Ground Truth: The Business of War. The series explores the often complicated and problematic realities of military contracting through the stories and insights of those with firsthand knowledge. PIJ querying and aggressive outreach beyond the network brought in insight and ideas from military contractors, around whom this series was conceived.

Minnesota Public Radio News

- **35w Bridge Collapse**
  From drivers just a few cars away from the bridge as it plummeted into the river, to people on a boat within 300 feet of the bridge as it collapsed, MPR News used PIJ querying to gather the firsthand experiences of many people who directly experienced the collapse of the 35W bridge. Pieced together, their stories offer a personal window on one of the biggest disasters in the state's history.
Accountants: Franken’s Tax Problems Should Have Been Caught
http://minnesota.publicradio.org/display/web/2008/05/01/accountants/
Al Franken blamed his accountant for giving him bad tax advice. But tax experts say the accountant should have known that Franken, who is seeking the DFL endorsement to run against GOP Sen. Norm Coleman, needed to pay taxes in the 19 different states where Franken earned money in the last four years. PIJ analysts queried accountants in the PIN to gather the expertise for this story.

New Hampshire Public Radio (NHPR)

Lost and found love
http://www.nhpr.org/node/12987
As the NH population ages, the central pieces of our lives, those things we take for granted, career, home, relationships, can all change dramatically. Dan Gorenstein has the story of two elderly couples. One has been married for over fifty years….the other has been together for about five.

The fabulous class of '52
http://www.nhpr.org/node/14257
Defenders of the first in the nation primary say it gives NH something unique… that face-to-face meeting that lets voters and candidates evaluate and understand each other. But a group of voters in Laconia believes the NH primary has given them something more: a passion for public service.

Oregon Public Broadcasting (OPB)

Hard Times
http://news.opb.org/hardtimes/
This series follows a dozen Oregonians throughout 2009 as they weathered unemployment and the personal consequences that followed. The participants in the series were identified and engaged through a combination of the PIN and community outreach. OPB received a Peabody Award for the series, and the awarding committee conferred high praise: “The Main Street repercussions of Wall Street’s reckless ways were nowhere in the media more humanly and thoughtfully documented than in this series of radio reports.”

As We Are
From Eve Epstein: “On Think Out Loud, we've started an "occasional series" called As We Are. We invite people in who are often "talked about, but who aren't often talked to." We've done hour-length shows on ex-convicts, people who are obese, teen mothers, women who have had abortions… We don't invite experts or pundits onto these shows. Not all the participants on these programs have come from PIN, but usually at least one guest comes from PIN and one or more came to us through a PIN recommendation. And the series is conceived very much in the spirit of PIN: people talking about their experience, on topics that are often politicized and talked about by pundits.”

Ex-convicts -- http://action.publicbroadcasting.net/obp/posts/list/1319610.page
Abortion stories -- http://action.publicbroadcasting.net/obp/posts/list/1590014.page

Puget Sound Public Radio (KUOW)

Mobile Home Owners Seek Stability
http://www.kuow.org/program.php?id=18589
This October 2009 documentary addressed the recession-induced disruptions faced by mobile home owners. From analyst Carolyn Adolph: "The goal of the real estate query was to hear from urbanites who had been evicted from an apartment building which later went condo. We got answers from people who had that experience, but our reporter was intrigued when a man who had lost his mobile home wrote in. The more she looked at the story the more interesting it became. The PIN source took her to a place - the mobile home park - and introduced her to a broader cast of characters."
Southern California Public Radio (KPCC)

- **Investigative Reporting on the Chino Prison Riot**
  http://www.scpr.org/specials/prison/
  SCPR analyst Sharon McNary manages the newsroom’s social media presence, and uses Twitter, Facebook and other sites to extend the reach of her PIN inquiries. These parallel approaches were instrumental in an investigation into prison abuse and the aftermath of riots at a California prison in summer of 2009. Sharon engaged sources to get inside the prison system, unearthing crucial insight, sources and stories that helped power the series. During the reporting of this project, questions raised by reporter Steven Cuevas about inmates being held outdoors in harsh conditions for days at a time, prompted a new investigation by the state Office of the Inspector General.

Speaking of Faith (APM)

- **Being Catholic**
  http://speakingoffaith.publicradio.org/programs/being_catholic/
  The program asked the network and its listeners about where Catholics find their anchors – and what unsettles them. The hundreds of responses led to interviews with PIN sources for a planned program on Catholicism. The strength and depth of PIN sources’ reflections prompted Speaking of Faith to depart from the usual format and instead produce a fabric of voices from the Church itself.

- **Spirituality of Parenting**
  http://speakingoffaith.publicradio.org/programs/spiritualityofparenting/index.shtml
  More and more people in our time are disconnected from religious institutions, at least for part of their lives. Others are religious and find themselves creating a family with a spouse from another tradition or no tradition at all. And the experience of parenting tends to raise spiritual questions anew. A PJ query gathered hundreds of reflections from parents on the topic. Their stories informed the interview at the heart of this episode, and are brought together in Your Voices, Your Stories: http://speakingoffaith.publicradio.org/programs/spiritualityofparenting/yourstories.shtml

The St. Louis Beacon

- **Race, Frankly**
  http://www.stlbeacon.org/content/view/9989/485/
  In St. Louis, race affects virtually every important aspect of community life. Yet it’s difficult to talk productively about race. In July 2009, we launched the Race, Frankly series in partnership with the Missouri History Museum. The Beacon invited readers to look at race with fresh eyes. Each month featured stories on specific topics, such as education, health care, politics and relationships, examining what role race plays. The museum partnership created outreach opportunities and helped the fledgling local PIN sign up sources. We queried the Network several times over a period of months, asking for personal race stories, insights into access to health care, racial profiling and how to talk with children about race. Insights were rich and surprising, and in many cases, the PIN connected the Beacon with sources who would have been difficult, if not impossible, to find otherwise. Those sources continue to inform our work today, on topics related to race, and many, many others. A few PIN-informed stories from Race, Frankly:
  
  The view from here: Personal perspectives on race, part 1
  The view from here: Personal perspectives on race, part 2
  Are you color blind? Do you even want to be? (a video)
  The view from here: In the classroom, then and now, race plays a role in learning
  Local woman, documentary filmmaker confront slavery from white perspective